20 November 2023

#### REFERRAL RESPONSE - HERITAGE

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| FILE NO: | **Development Applications:** 477/2019/2 |
|  |  |
| ADDRESS: | 30 Alma Street PADDINGTON 2021 |
|  |  |
| PROPOSAL: | Modifications to the approved scheme |
|  |  |
| FROM: | Nastaran Forouzesh |
|  |  |
| TO: | Mr V Aleidzans |

1. **DOCUMENTATION**

The following documentation provided by the applicant has been examined for this referral response:

* Drawing set by Cottee Parker Architects, dated 9 June 2023, Revision 02
* Heritage Impact Statement by Urbis, dated 6 November 2023
* Section 4.56 Planning Statement by Sutherland & Associates Planning, dated August 2023
* CGI renders of the approval DA2019/477/1 and architectural modelled renders in both approved and proposal colours

1. **SITE INSPECTION / RESEARCH**

The following research was undertaken in the preparation of this assessment:

* The site was inspected on 10 November 2023, including the general locality.

Review of the following documents and photographic evidence:

* Council’s property system, to establish dates of earlier building and development applications for the subject and surrounding properties.
* Previous heritage referral response for DA2019/477/1 by Council’s Heritage Officer Flavia Scardamaglia dated 9 March 2020.
* Conservation Management Plan by Conybeare Morrison International, dated April 2008
* Heritage Impact Statement by Urbis for DA2019/477/1, dated 19 August 2019
* Council’s photography files relevant to the immediate area
* Council’s heritage inventory sheets
* Council’s aerial photography and mapping database
* Google Maps – street view

1. **STATUTORY AND POLICY DOCUMENTS**

The following statutory and policy documents are relevant to the application:

* National Parks & Wildlife Act 1974
* Woollahra LEP 2014
* Woollahra DCP 2015
* Conservation Management Plan (CMP) by Conybeare Morrison, dated 2008

1. **ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT**

**Compliance with the relevant legislative framework and planning controls**

1. **SIGNIFICANCE OF SUBJECT PROPERTY/TO THE CONSERVATION AREA**

|  |
| --- |
| The subject property is located at 30 Alma Street, Paddington, located within the Paddington Heritage Conservation Area. It previously housed the White City Tennis Centre. In 2015, DA2015/438 was approved by the Joint Regional Planning Panel for Stage 1 concept proposal for only the building envelopes and indicative use of the site as a multi-purpose sports centre and registered club facilities. A S4.55 Application was subsequently approved. In July 2021, DA2019/477/1 was approved for the first stage of the development. These proposed works are currently underway.  The following Statements of Significance for the White City Tennis Centre and Centre Courts have been extracted from pages 24 and 28 of the Heritage Impact Statement by Urbis dated December 2018:  *White City Tennis Centre is considered to possess cultural and heritage significance in view of their ability to demonstrate the following matters:*  **White City Tennis Centre**  *The White City tennis centre is a rare example of a sporting venue that became the focus of major Australian and international attention attracting world class tennis players, celebrities and large spectator crowds from around the world, including the 1954 Davis Cup unbroken world record of 25,578 spectators. It has continuously operated as a tennis centre since 1922 and is the largest open-air tennis centre in Sydney.*  *The White City tennis centre demonstrates the significant role played by tennis as a form of recreation, entertainment and competition in NSW and Australia. White City is associated with the development of tennis and the dominance of Australia as a tennis-playing nation on the world stage. Apart from the international tennis events such as the Davis Cup, the Australian and NSW Amateur and Open Championships have been played at the centre.*  *The two Centre Courts, the championship courts surrounded by grandstands at the south of the site, are of high historic and social significance as the core precinct of the tennis complex. The Centre Court space and its containment as an arena evoke a sense of occasion and are associated with memories of both victory and defeat. The Southern Stand is historically significant as the first to be constructed about the Centre Court in 1923 and for its association with the Lawn Tennis Association Presidents' and Ground Members' seats.*  *Apart from its association with international tennis competitions and contributions to Australia's international sporting image, the White City tennis centre is also held in high community esteem at the local level for its popularity as a community sporting and social facility.*    *Technical advances associated with White City include the first electric scoreboard in Australia, a portable machine built by club member Ted Booth for the 1952 NSW Championships. In 1957 the NSW titles were televised live for the first time anywhere in the country as television was just one year old in Australia. The tennis court surfaces, particularly the lawn and Rebound Ace Centre Courts, are representative of the better surfaces nationally and worldwide.*  *There has been a long association between the NSW Lawn tennis Association, now Tennis NSW, and White City Tennis Club who have jointly operated on the site since 1948, originally in separate clubhouses and between1971-1999 jointly under the Northern Stand. Both have a long association with the history of tennis, which is encapsulated in the extensive collection of memorabilia held in the Australian Tennis Museum and by the White City Club.*  *The open storm-water channel that traverses the site is an arm of Sydney Water's Rushcutters Bay Stormwater Channel No. 84, one of the first of nine purpose built stormwater channels constructed in Sydney in the 1890s. The concrete channel follows the central axis of the La Crozia Valley allowing an understanding of the 18th century topography and the evolution from Glenmore Creek, to an open sewer and finally to the current stormwater channel.*  *The White City site demonstrates the development of Lower Paddington. Originally the land of the Aboriginal Eora people, the site was part of an 1817 grant to William Thomas, although the topography of the site made it unsuitable for settlement. The site came to be used for market gardening first by Europeans and then by Chinese market gardeners who cultivated the land and dominated the supply of fresh fruit and vegetables to the region. The market gardens were replaced by the White City Amusement Park, 1913 -1917, from where the place's current name was gained.*  *The continuous green space and open recreational areas of White City and Lower Paddington are a landmark in the area. The site occupies the lowest ground within a broad shallow valley creating a sense of intimacy due to the enclosure by the surrounding hill-slopes. There are rare views and vistas from within and from outside the site that are unique in Paddington.*  **Centre Courts**  *The Centre Courts have high cultural significance on a state level.*  *White City Centre Courts are of high historic and social significance as the core precinct of the tennis complex that is associated with the development of tennis in Australia and the dominance of Australia as a tennis-playing nation on the world stage.*  *The Centre Courts between 1920s-1999, provided the focus for numerous Australian and international tennis tournaments that attracted world class players and record crowds, including the 1954 Davis Cup unbroken world record of 25,578 spectators.*  *The Centre Courts arena is a unique area of the White City Tennis complex. It is held in high community esteem as the contained space evokes a sense of occasion and is associated with memories of victory and defeat of significant contests.*  *White City led the way in technical advances by laying a Rebound Ace synthetic surface at Centre Court in 1989. The competition grass court, a mixture of different varieties of couch grass, is a quality surface, expertly prepared and maintained.*  *White City Tennis Centre had the first portable electric scoreboard, now not extant, which was built by Ted Both in 1952 for the NSW championships. In 1957 the NSW titles were televised live for the first time in the country as television was just one year old in Australia.*  White City is identified as a ‘Registered’ site on the non-statutory Register of the National Estate (Place ID 101983, Place File No.1/12/041/0129). A Statement of Significance is available at <http://www.environment.gov.au/cgi-bin/ahdb/search.pl?mode=place_detail;search=place_name%3Dwhite%2520city%3Bkeyword_PD%3Don%3Bkeyword_SS%3Don%3Bkeyword_PH%3Don%3Blatitude_1dir%3DS%3Blongitude_1dir%3DE%3Blongitude_2dir%3DE%3Blatitude_2dir%3DS%3Bin_region%3Dpart;place_id=101983> , which is copied below:  *The White City tennis centre (opening in 1922 and operating continuously to the present), demonstrates the significant role played by tennis as a form of recreation, entertainment and competition in NSW and Australia. White City has hosted a range of national and international tennis events including the Davis Cup, Australian Open, and NSW Open Championships. It has served as a significant sporting venue over many years.   The White City tennis centre has historic significance for its contribution to the international perception of Australia as a world class sporting nation, through it serving as the venue for many international tennis events such as the Australian Open Championships and the Davis Cup.   The White City tennis centre is linked to the history of the game of Lawn Tennis and the New South Wales Lawn Tennis Association which established the White City tennis centre in 1922 and continues to occupy the site. The tennis centre has been utilised by the NSW Lawn Tennis Association (Tennis NSW) and the White City Club, which have a long association with the social history of tennis in the region and the state.   The Centre Court area and surrounding tennis courts have historic significance, having served as the arena for international and national tennis events of significance. The Centre Court area contains the championship grass court used at the pinnacle of Davis Cup popularity and a synthetic grass court. The southern grandstand, constructed in 1923, is still in existence today as part of the Centre Court area, and elements of the 1930s northern stand are still evident.   White City tennis centre has the first Electric Scoreboard which was built by Ted Booth in 1952 for* *the NSW championships. In 1957 the NSW titles were televised live for the first time anywhere in the country as television was just one year old in Australia.   The White City site demonstrates the evolution of Lower Paddington. The land was originally part of a grant given in 1817 to William Thomas, although the topography of the site made it unsuitable for settlement. The site came to be used for market gardening first by Europeans, and then by Chinese market gardeners who cultivated the land and dominated the supply of fresh fruit and vegetables to the region. The market gardens were replaced by the White City Amusement Park, 1913 to 1917, from where the place's current name was gained.   The open storm water channel is evidence of the former drainage and former creek that ran through the site and is an identifiable early element of the site.   (Criterion A.4) (Australian Historic Themes: 8.1 Organising recreation: Playing and watching organised sports; 3.21 Entertaining for profit; 3.12 Feeding people: Developing sources of fresh local produce; 3.11 Altering the environment: Reclaiming land)   Through the years the place has been associated with many famous tennis players, both Australian and International (Criterion H.1).   The White City tennis centre is of social significance. The tennis centre is held in high regard within the tennis and wider community as the location of significant sporting/tennis championships, and as a prestigious sporting facility. The site is associated with many popular tennis players. The facilities provided by the White City site have brought together people from all over the State, the country and internationally to play both as amateurs and professionals. The Centre Courts and grandstands are viewed as significant by the community, being the arena where many have watched significant tennis games played (Criterion G.1).   The White City tennis courts are a rare example of a sporting venue in Australia where important events such as the Davis Cup where held. The Centre Court area has one of the few remaining natural grass courts in Australia which has the capacity to host a major competition (Criterion B.2).   The White City tennis courts make a major contribution to the distinctive aesthetic appearance of the Lower Paddington area with its large area of continuous green flat space that begins at Rushcutters Bay and merges together with the Weigall Sports Ground, White City tennis courts and Trumper Park. The site is surrounded by hill slopes rising away from a valley floor.   The White City tennis courts have retained a low lying green open space character which assists in the understanding of the history of the site and is aesthetically appealing.*  *The place is also of aesthetic significance because of the views available into and from the Centre. Significant vistas include those from the site to Paddington, taking in the Paddington 'amphitheatre' and from outside the site looking into and across it including those from New South Head Road, Alma Street, Nield Avenue, Glenmore Road, and Walker Avenue. (Criterion E.1).*  The Heritage Referral Response by Council’s Heritage Officer Flavia Scardamaglia, dated 9 March 2020 for DA2019/477/1 identified the following contributory items within the subject property:   1. *The 1923 southern grandstand for which it is proposed adaptive re-use. The 1923 section of the stand is graded as ‘high’ in the 2015 CMP by Urbis, however later additions are of little significance at local level;* 2. *The ‘heritage arches’ which are remnants of the 1932 grandstand designed by Professor Leslie Wilkinson for the NSW Lawn Tennis Association. There are graded of ‘High’ significance at local level in the 2015 CMP report by Urbis. There is no mention to Leslie Wilkinson’s design in the Urbis report;* 3. *The centre courts between the northern and southern grandstands. This is graded of ‘high’ significance at State level in the 2015 CMP by Urbis;* 4. *Ticket building and NSWTA Gates which are graded of little and moderate significance respectively at local level in the 2015 CMP by Urbis;* 5. *Moveable Heritage – Tennis NSW Memorabilia which is graded on high significance at State level in the 2015 CMP by Urbis. White City Club Memorabilia are graded of high significance at local level; and* 6. *The green and open valley character is also considered to be of high significance in terms of view and vistas across the site from various angles and from within the White City grounds.* 7. *The c1922 timber (Western) bridge connecting 30 Alma street to the northern area of White City. It is understood this is not within the area subject to the development proposal, therefore no assessment will be undertaken as part of this proposal.* |

The Proposal

The proposed Section 4.55 Application includes the following modifications to the Approved DA (DA2019/477/1):

* Changes to the materiality of the new gym and clubhouse
* Addition of a rock climbing wall along the northern side of the multi-use courts
* Changes to the design of the entry from Glenmore Road
* Relocation of three approved skylights on the roof of the southern grandstand

National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974

|  |
| --- |
| The site is in an area of No Aboriginal Heritage Sensitivity. Therefore, an Aboriginal Heritage Impact Assessment was not required as part of the S4.55 Application to ascertain whether potential Aboriginal cultural heritage will be impacted by the proposal. In addition, the proposed modifications would not include any excavation works. As a result, no Aboriginal Heritage Conditions of Consent would be required. |

Woollahra LEP 2014 Clause 5.10 Heritage Conservation

The subject site is not a heritage item in Woollahra Local Environment Plan 2014 ‘the LEP’ and is within a heritage conservation area.

*Significance of items in the vicinity*

The following listed heritage item is located in proximity of the site:

* ‘7 Canary Island Date Palms’ at Alma Street (within road reserve), Paddington (Item No. 243)

**Consideration**

The proposed modifications would generally be in keeping with the original approval and would therefore have no adverse impact on the heritage significance, setting, views and fabric of the heritage item in the vicinity.

Comparison of Heritage Impacts Between the Original Approval (DA2019/477/1) and the Current S4.55 Proposal

The following table compares the current proposal with the original approval by the Joint Regional Planning Panel and assesses impact on the identified contributory elements at the site.

| **Contributory Element** | | **DA2019/477/1** | **Current S4.55 Application** | **Impact** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **1** | **Southern Grandstand (1923)** | Proposed to be adaptively reused, with the majority of the southern stands existing structure to remain where possible to retain the historical presence of the original southern stand. The external appearances along Glenmore Road will largely be retained. | The current application includes modifications to the approved materiality of the proposed new grandstand. The new materiality would be a mixture of contemporary and traditional materiality in a neutral colour scheme.  New entry gate along Glenmore Road. The new gate is in keeping with the approved development in terms of design and materiality. | No additional impact, the works would be in keeping with the original approval. |
| **2** | **Northern Grandstand (‘Heritage Arches’ or ‘Wilkinson’s Arches’)** | Retained and opened up to the north side. The arches will be integrated with the proposed swimming pool deck and connected to a new set of stairs to the west. | No works are proposed to the northern grandstand as part of the S4.55 Application. | No impact. |
| **3** | **Centre courts** | To be built upon subject to heritage interpretation strategies aiming to retain the remembrance of such open enclosure. | No works are proposed to the centre court as part of the S4.55 Application. | No impact. |
| **4** | **Ticket Building and NSWTA Gates** | The building of little significance is to be demolished. The Gates will be retained and relocated to the Alma Street entrance. | No works are proposed to the Ticket Building and NSWTA Gates as part of the S4.55 Application. | No impact. |
| **5** | **Moveable heritage and Tennis NSW Memorabilia** | Retained in interpretative displays in the lobby space of the Gym in the southern stand. | No works are proposed to the moveable heritage and Tennis NSW Memorabilia as part of the S4.55 Application. | No impact. |
| **6** | **Green and open valley character** | Retained due to relocation of the Clubhouse building, retained topography levels and opening up of views within the site. | No works are proposed to the green and open valley character as part of the application. | No impact. |

Woollahra DCP 2015

|  |
| --- |
| The subject site is within the Paddington Heritage Conservation Area, and is considered a contributory item and a significant item.  The Woollahra DCP 2015 does not contain specific provisions for grandstands or sporting facilities. In addition, it is noted that *Clause 1.3.11 Public buildings* is not relevant to the subject property as it only applies to post offices and police stations. *Clause 1.3.13 Infill development (new development)* and *Clause 1.3.12 Existing contemporary infill* also do not apply to the subject property. As a result, the proposed works will not be assessed against Clause 1.3 Building types of the DCP.  **Part C – Heritage Conservation Areas – C1 Paddington HCA DCP**  ***UNDERSTANDING THE CONTEXT***  Clause 1.2.3 Character Elements   * The proposed modifications will continue to retain the open space and landscape features of White City, which complies.   Clause 1.2.4 Desired future character   * The proposal is consistent with the objectives of the desired future character and the character elements of Paddington, including open space and landscape features.   ***SPECIFIC POLICY FOR BUILDING AND SITE ELEMENTS***  Clause 1.5.1 Dormers and skylights  Control C28   * The proposal includes the relocation of three skylights, which is supported in principle. The skylights are to be of a low profile and flush with the roof surface in order to comply. A condition of consent will be provided below.   Clause 1.5.8 Materials, finishes and details  Objectives O2  Controls C4   * The proposal includes modifications to the materiality of the gym and the new clubhouse. The approved materials were clearly contemporary, while employing a traditional approach through the use of metal cladding. The new materiality would consist of clearly contemporary materials, combined with some traditional materials – dry pack stone. The modifications are generally in keeping with the approved development and would not be seen to have any adverse impact on the heritage significance of the subject site or the Paddington HCA. It is therefore supported from a heritage perspective and complies. * The proposal also includes modifications to the design and materiality of the entry gate along Glenmore Road. The new wall would be of a rendered and painted masonry construction while the gate would be of timber construction. The proposed materiality is supported from a heritage perspective and would not have an adverse impact on the Glenmore Road streetscape or the Paddington HCA.   Clause 1.5.9 Exterior colours  Objective O1  Controls C1, C9   * The proposed colour scheme continue to be generally muted and in keeping with the heritage significance of the Paddington HCA. It is therefore supported and complies. |

Conservation Management Plan (CMP) by Conybeare Morrison dated April 2008

The CMP by Conybeare Morrison dated April 2008 provides conservation policies so that the cultural significance of the site is retained and enhanced. The proposed modifications to the approved development have been assessed against the conservation policies outlined in Section 6.0 of the CMP.

The following consideration is provided:

The proposed modifications to the approved DA are minor and include changes to the approved new materiality of the gym and clubhouse, relocation of three skylights along the roof of the approved gym, the addition of a climbing wall and a new design for the Glenmore Road pedestrian entry. The works will continue to retain the open space and landscape features of White City. In addition, there would be no works to the significant fabric of the site which was being retained as part of the original proposal. As discussed above, the proposed new works including the new materials for the buildings and the entry would be in keeping with the approved and would not have a negative impact on the cultural significance of the property. The remainder of the works are considered to be minor and would not have any adverse impacts. The works are generally in compliance with the policies of the CMP and supported from a heritage perspective.

1. **CONCLUSION**

Woollahra LEP 2014

*Part 5.10*

* Clause 1(a) The development does conserve the heritage of Woollahra.
* Clause 1(b) The impact upon the heritage significance of the conservation area will be neutral.
* Clause 4 This referral constitutes an assessment under this clause.

1. **RECOMMENDATION**

The proposal is generally acceptable, subject to conditions, as it complies with the relevant statutory and policy documents and would have a satisfactory impact.

Consent, subject to conditions:

*Standard Conditions*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **D** |  | **Modification of Details of the Development (section 4.17(1)(g) of the Act** |
| Before the issue of any construction certificate, the approved plans and the construction certificate plans and specification, required to be submitted to the Principal Certifier under clause 7 of the Development Certification and Fire Safety Regulations, must detail the following amendments:  Skylights  Any new skylights are to be of a low profile, flush with the roof surface.   * Woollahra DCP 2015, Chapter C1, Clause 1.5.1, Control C28 |
| **Condition Reason:** To require design changes and/or further information to be provided to address specific issues identified during the assessment under section 4.15 of the Act. |

Nastaran Forouzesh 20 November 2023

**Heritage Officer Completion Date**